

Examining Patriotism Between Multiculturalism and Ethnoculturalism

Mansurni Abadi¹, Putu Ayu Suniadewi²

¹Avondale University, Coranborg, NSW, Australia

²Inti International university and college, Kuala Lumpur, Malaysia

Correspondence: putuayusuniadewi@gmail.com²



Received: August 17, 2025 | Revised: August 24, 2025 | Accepted: August 31, 2025



<https://doi.org/10.69812/jgs.v2i2.160>

ABSTRACT

Patriotism, as a form of collective loyalty to the nation, is a complex phenomenon shaped by competing cultural and philosophical frameworks. Contemporary debates often contrast multiculturalist perspectives, which promote inclusivity and civic values, with ethnoculturalist views that emphasize homogeneity rooted in ethnicity, language, or cultural heritage. This study aims to examine patriotism within these contrasting paradigms and to explore their implications for national identity, social cohesion, and political life. Employing a systematic literature review (SLR) methodology, the research synthesizes theoretical insights from anthropology, sociology, political science, and philosophy. The analysis highlights that multiculturalist approaches view patriotism as inclusive, fostering unity through diversity and shared civic responsibility, while ethnoculturalist perspectives tend to reinforce exclusivity, privileging dominant cultural groups and marginalizing minorities. Findings further reveal that extreme forms of cosmopolitanism and nationalism each pose challenges, potentially weakening cohesion by drawing citizens toward polarized positions. Between these poles, patriotism is understood as a socially constructed sentiment mediated by rituals, symbols, and collective memory, requiring both integrity and responsibility. The study concludes that a balanced form of patriotism integrating civic values with cultural recognition offers a more sustainable framework for pluralistic societies. By navigating between multiculturalism and ethnoculturalism, this research underscores the importance of moderation in cultivating national solidarity without erasing cultural differences.

Keyword: Patriotism, Multiculturalism, Ethnoculturalism



INTRODUCTION

When we say that we are loyal to or love our country, we do not have in mind its geographical boundaries or physical features. What we think of is rather the national collectivity to which we belong, a collectivity that, because of its character, history, and shared destiny. It is distinct from all other such collectivities. To be meaningful, the consensus that holds a country together must

be evolved, evolving, and voluntary, not one that is static or decreed. However, it always has to be borne in mind that loyalty to one's rulers, that is to those who hold the reins of power, and loyalty to the state are two different things, and that the latter, if based solely on the former, can be brittle. It would also be helpful to remember that even loyalty to the state is what we often refer to as patriotism.

According to Samsu (2022) In the context of discussions regarding the nation-state, patriotism is essential and needs to be instilled and nurtured in citizens to ensure the country's survival. Patriotic behavior is considered a moral obligation of citizens, which demands "moral courage" to correct what is wrong with our country so as not to embarrass it in the eyes of other nations and at the same time defend our country when it is humiliated by other nations (Li et al., 2022; Lin & Jackson, 2023). Therefore, numerous studies have found that patriotism motivates citizens to engage in civic duties and work to maintain and improve their country's society (Callan, 2006).

On other side, The concepts of patriotism and nationalism, while often used interchangeably in popular discourse, represent fundamentally different attitudes toward one's nation. Understanding the distinctions between these two constructs involves exploring their definitions, emotional connotations, and implications for social identity and behavior. Patriotism is typically characterized by a positive emotional attachment to one's country, which includes feelings of love, loyalty, and pride. It is often viewed as a benevolent sentiment that encourages civic participation and social responsibility without necessarily invoking hostility toward other nations. In contrast, nationalism is often associated with a more aggressive or exclusivist stance regarding national identity (Huang et al., 2023; Pekkanen & Penttälä, 2021; Subaryana, 2022; Wimmer, 2019).

It is frequently described as an intense loyalty to one's nation that can manifest in a belief in superiority over other nations. But Nationalism can take various forms, including chauvinistic nationalism, which emphasizes the uniqueness and superiority of one's own ethnic or national group, often leading to the marginalization of others (Eamonn Callan, 2006; McCorkle & Rodriguez, 2023; Rupar et al., 2021; Sekerdej & Roccas, 2016) Such forms of nationalism can be linked to prejudice and hostility, especially in their extreme manifestations, as they may invoke a sense of threat from outsiders and foster divisive attitudes within multiethnic societies (Finell & Zogmaister, 2015; Marinthe et al., 2023; McCorkle & Rodriguez, 2023).

But we need to realize nationalism not always bad because nationalism itself encompasses a diverse range of attitudes and movements regarding national identity, and its evaluation as "bad" or "good" varies significantly depending on its form and context (Dikici, 2022; Lestari & Sihombing, 2022; Syarifah et al., 2023). While many scholarly discussions emphasize the negative attributes of nationalism, particularly its potential to incite ethnic conflict and xenophobia, there are also arguments recognizing its positive dimensions, particularly when it manifests as civic or multicultural nationalism that provides a framework for acknowledging and integrating diverse cultural identities within a national narrative. Such forms of nationalism can establish a foundation for recognizing and valuing the contributions of various ethnic groups, enriching the overall national fabric rather than threatening it (Kitromilides, 2018; Mallon, 2023).

However, currently, the issue of patriotism is faced with the challenge of cosmopolitanism. Many contemporary scholars and activists in the West, such as George Kateb (born 1931) and Martha Nussbaum (born 1947), continue to revive the idea of cosmopolitanism with the belief that humans will no longer be controlled and supported by the government or any institution if all humans are

placed under global institutions that support cosmopolitanism as envisioned. Regarding (Doomen, 2012; Glass, 1994; Grünzweig, 2021; Kaiser, 2012; Modzelewski, 2014; Salles et al., 2023; Pabubung, 2023; Robeyns, 2005; Vevere, 2021).

Only recently have we discovered that some of them have acknowledged that the spirit of patriotism encompasses aspects of primitivism or local customs and culture, and that the notion that all humans must be served is a mistake. Martha Nussbaum herself, who in the past was very fierce about the idea of cosmopolitanism, has now relaxed her stance and acknowledged the importance of the sentiment of premodernity for every group of people. Most significantly, they began to recognize that, where possible, non-citizens should also be treated in the same way as citizens, as is the case in the principles of cosmopolitanism or universalism (Modzelewski, 2014; Salles et al., 2023; Vevere, 2021).

The establishment of institutions such as the UN has brought with it various universal declarations, for example, the Universal Declaration of Human Rights, which seeks to validate that, based on universal values, no human being, regardless of gender, ethnicity, religion, or disability, may be discriminated against. Even though at first glance, these so-called universal values seem pure, of course, there are issues for example, those related to religion, citizenship, gender roles, and disability that need to be differentiated, by religious and cultural demands.

Many people are unaware that much of this cosmopolitanism is a secular version of the Christian Commonwealth, which was divided due to the emergence of the Protestant movement in Europe in the past. The individualism movement in the West originated from the religious teachings advocated by Protestant Christianity itself (Chaplin, 2023; Szymborski, 2020). When it was secularized, it took on the label of liberalism, which was later adopted, incorporating the dimension of universalism or universality. We want to explain here that a strong belief in cosmopolitanism, which embodies the universal principle of human rights, can also explain the spirit of patriotism. Whether or not, in the life of a nation, there are many principles of citizenship, some of which may not be compatible, so some of them are also contradictory (Barysenka, 2022; Chaplin, 2023; Fischer et al., 2007; Pietkiewicz, 2021; Szymborski, 2020).

For example, in ensuring the principle of transparency and human rights for all human beings, does it also mean that non-citizens also need to be given the same access as citizens? Suppose it is true that there is fraud in the military system. Can individuals with access to that information leak state secrets to certain parties, such as WikiLeaks, solely to defend the human rights of all individuals and promote universal safety? Of course, there is a sure way for a country to handle its domestic problems, and it is not normal for all household matters to be shared with other neighboring countries. Does the local political culture have to be abandoned solely because it seeks to incorporate the universalist ideas referenced by Eurocentrism?

The cosmopolitanism left by Immanuel Kant in "Perpetual Peace" (1795) and "Idea for a Universal History with a Cosmopolitan Aim" (1784), where he envisions a global federation of states aimed at achieving enduring peace through shared legal and ethical frameworks has a strong influence on liberalism and universalism, as the scientific and cultural traditions in the West are more strongly influenced by the liberal tradition compared to the conservative tradition (Cavallar, 2012; Kleingeld, 2016; Marwah, 2022; Vucic, 2023). The tradition of universalism also has a powerful influence on the core knowledge taught in the ivory tower (Huber, 2017; Marwah, 2022; Städtler, 2019). Although it is acknowledged that

there is much to be learned from the traditions of universalism and cosmopolitanism, this knowledge should be applied selectively or with reservations, so that the benefits can be great for all our religions and cultures in Indonesia.

In our research, we started from the hypothesis that the stronger the influence of universalism in a particular country, the weaker the spirit of patriotism will be. By examining the dialectic between patriotism and multiculturalism, or patriotism and ethnocultural identity, we aim to find a balance between these two concepts. Understanding this issue involves examining how universalist values, which those promoting global citizenship and equality interact with, influence different expressions of nationalism and ethnocultural identities across contexts, allowing them to navigate and negotiate these challenging yet enriching identities.

RESEARCH METHOD

This study using literature review methodology for analyzing patriotism through anthropological, sociological, political, and philosophical lenses, this study seeks to demonstrate the multifaceted nature of patriotism as both a social phenomenon and a political construct. By synthesizing various theoretical perspectives, we can better understand the dynamics underlying patriotic sentiments and their implications in contemporary society.

The significance of conducting a literature review in academic research is profound. A literature review serves multiple essential purposes: it assesses the existing state of knowledge on a topic, highlights research gaps, and presents a synthesized understanding of both theoretical and empirical contributions within the field. Basically, literature review is critical for enabling readers to understand the current state-of-the-art in a particular area of research and contextualize new findings within that framework. This process is crucial for both seasoned researchers and students, as it fosters an environment of informed inquiry and scholarly debate.

Conducting an effective literature review is a meticulous process guided by various methodologies and frameworks. For analysis interplay patriotism between multiculturalism and ethnoculturalism this research using systematic literature review (SLR) involve comprehensive searching, selection of studies, and synthesis of findings, ensuring rigor and reproducibility. emphasize the importance of employing diverse methods to enhance literature identification, especially in areas where standardized terminologies are lacking (Al-Jayyousi et al., 2022; Aldrich & Rudman, 2016; Aly, 2022; Borolla1 & Marini, 2022; Brata, 2018; Brönnimann, 2022; Clandini & Conelly, 2000; Crăciunescu, 2016; Creswell & David, 2018; Fendy et al., 2023; Hossain et al., 2022; Khushk et al., 2023).

Furthermore, the integration of gray literature, as noted by Páez, adds richness to systematic reviews that formal publications might overlook (Páez, 2017). This suggests that an effective literature review synthesizes published research and incorporates a broader range of evidence to generate a comprehensive understanding of the topic.

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

There are at least two critical characteristics that must be practiced and lived by to ensure the spirit of patriotism can be developed and strengthened. The first is a sense of obedience to the superior values of the homeland or country, and the second is a sense of respect for fellow human beings. If these two superior values, obedience and respect, are lost from the appreciation and intensity of citizens, then not only will patriotism become increasingly thin, but the cohesion

of citizens will be affected, and the country will not be able to develop, and progress will not be achieved if peace cannot be maintained. Between these two extremes, namely radical cosmopolitanism and radical nationalism, lies the spirit of patriotism.

1. Radical Cosmopolitanism

Radical cosmopolitanism can be conceptualized as an extension of cosmopolitan principles that call for a reevaluation of global justice through the lens of universal human rights, with a strong emphasis on including diverse voices and experiences from marginalized global communities (Huber, 2017; Murphy, 2019). This perspective diverges from classical cosmopolitanism, often framed within Eurocentric or Western paradigms that do not fully account for the complexities and particularities of non-Western contexts (Davids, 2018; Golding, 2017; Hajir & Kester, 2020; Uimonen, 2020).

At its core, radical cosmopolitanism is characterized by an insistence on interconnectivity while recognizing the political significance of identity. It encourages transcending national boundaries and identity politics, allowing various cultural expressions to participate in forming a global society (Murphy, 2019; Städtler, 2019).

Furthermore, scholars suggest that radical cosmopolitanism fosters transformative political agency by embracing multiplicity in identities, notably through postcolonial lenses that challenge colonial and imperial imaginations of global order. This approach views the intersection of cosmopolitanism and local particularities as a dynamic space for potential agency against global injustices, positing that neither globalism nor nationalism should claim absolute authority (Hajir & Kester, 2020; Uimonen, 2020).

The implications of radical cosmopolitanism are profound, particularly in contexts influenced by global crises, social tensions, and national conflicts. For instance, some scholars assert that radical cosmopolitanism has the potential to counter forms of ethnic nationalism and populism that have emerged in reaction to globalization's discontents, advocating for an inclusive societal framework that recognizes and respects differences (Gutierrez Rodriguez et al., 2016; Schlote, 2022; Wu, 2022).

2. Radical Nationalism

Radical nationalism can be defined as a political ideology that emphasizes the belief in the superiority and primacy of one's nation, often culminating in exclusionary practices towards perceived outsiders or minorities. Under liberal values in western country, radical nationalism considered the spirit of the times (*zeigeist*) to protect Europe and western civilization as a whole from threats (Halikiopoulou et al., 2013). It operates on the premise that national identity, typically based on ethnic or cultural homogeneity, is paramount, which leads to the rejection of multicultural integration and an increasing nativist sentiment.

This form of nationalism often manifests through organizations and political parties that advocate for policies favoring the 'native' population while perceiving non-natives as threats to national unity and identity (Caiani & Kröll, 2017; Leidig et al., 2022; Lundström & Poletti Lundström, 2023; Rodi et al., 2023; Swanson, 2023). Characteristically, radical nationalism is marked by several defining features: nativism, authoritarianism, and populism. Nativism drives the belief that the nation should be exclusively inhabited by members of the native group, as seen in the rhetoric of radical right-wing parties across Europe and beyond (Caiani & Kröll, 2017; Lundström & Poletti Lundström, 2023; Rodi et al., 2023).

Authoritarianism emphasizes the need for strong, often unyielding leadership and the prioritization of national over democratic values (Arhin et al., 2023; Van Hiel et al., 2022), while populism appeals to a large electorate by presenting the radical right as the true representatives of the 'common people' against a corrupt elite (Akkerman et al., 2017; Albertazzi & Bonansinga, 2024; Hartevelde et al., 2022).

The impact of radical nationalism on society can be profound and multifaceted. This ideology often polarizes communities by creating an "us versus them" mentality, fostering social division and conflict (Albertazzi & Bonansinga, 2024; Lundström & Poletti Lundström, 2023; Van Hiel et al., 2022). Additionally, radical nationalist parties have significantly influenced political landscapes across Europe, often leading to shifts in policy-making, especially around issues of immigration, welfare, and national security.

For instance, the rise in radical right parties has often coincided with economic strife, where austerity measures exacerbate feelings of disenfranchisement and fear about national identity, pushing voters toward radical solutions (Lundström & Poletti Lundström, 2023; Van et al., 2022).

Such movements not only serve to mobilize voter bases but also pave the way for increased state surveillance and control, particularly of marginalized groups, under the guise of national security. Furthermore, radical nationalism plays a critical role in the broader context of global politics, where it serves as a reactionary force against globalization and multiculturalism. As populations perceive threats to their cultural heritage and economic stability due to immigration and globalism, radical nationalist ideologies gain traction, often distorting public discourse and leading to legislative changes that favor exclusionary practices.

This response often seeks a return to an idealized past, where societies are seen as ethnically homogeneous, further complicating contemporary political discussions surrounding national identity and citizenship. Essentially, radical cosmopolitanism must be rejected based on slogans and cries of human universality, because humans cannot serve other humans equally under any circumstances. This is because love for one's family, country, and religion must take precedence over love based on the spirit of universal human rights. The state must not only give priority to its citizens, but that priority must be special.

Citizens must also defend their country by prioritizing extraordinary loyalty to their nation, rather than prioritizing other countries or international institutions. This does not mean that the principle of "My country, right or wrong" must be accepted literally and blindly according to its words. Still, it must be lived so that the spirit in that phrase, which is imbued with the values of obedience and respect, must be lived and practiced. Unquestioningly giving loyalty to the country is not patriotism; that is called blind patriotism (Iceland et al., 2023; Lin et al., 2022; Hiel et al., 2022).

Too radical love for a race by nurturing narrow ethnocultural nationalism will not lead the country to its goals and progress because it only invites instability and prolonged unquenchable fire of chaos. If a country's decisions and policies are not made with a spirit of patriotism, but rather with the belief in narrow cosmopolitanism or nationalism, they will not yield optimal effects of goodness within the country (Bracic et al., 2023; Dayioğlu, 2022; Zhuravlev & Ishchenko, 2020). Not only will policies have to be changed and modified due to opposition from citizens, but the existing government will also not be able to last long. A government that can last long is a government that has politicians who can make

accurate judgments between the harmful effects of multiculturalism and the vile effects of ethnoculturalism and nationalism.

3. Between Ethnoculturalism and Multiculturalism

In a society, there are certainly groups that fiercely defend the superiority of their racial identity to the point where some become so extreme. In general, ethnoculturalism is a spirit based on the identity of a race. In the context of Indonesia, this spirit based on identity is reflected in ethnic and religious groups. In terms of theory, extreme racial nationalism is significantly influenced by Carl Schmitt's thought, as seen in his work "The Concept of the Political" (1932) (Kim, 2020; Zizek, 1999).

He believes that the reality of each entity will always be hostile to other entities. Therefore, education on friends and enemies must be taught, as this is the reality of human nature. Radical racial nationalists are those who are racist, and racism is a reflection of this friends and enemies thinking, where loyalty to one race causes the race concerned to see the other race not only as an enemy, but can also reach the level of tribalism. Racial tension easily flares up until one race considers the other race as a ghost or animal, where xenophobia is very easy to occur (Green, 2000; Lash, 2017; Mader, 2016; Schildkraut, 2003).

In his work, Schmitt holds a paradoxical view, as he rejects the parliamentary system, which he believes limits the power and will of the people. He supports the executive branch of government in Germany, which at that time was under the leadership of Hitler. During Hitler's time, Habermas was once in the army, as mentioned before. Schmitt was a strong supporter of the absolute government at that time, as reflected in his theory of the absoluteness of the executive power (Herrero, 2003; Ward, 2022).

His idea is dangerous because it is very easy for nationalists in a country to attract racist sentiments in their country. Loving one's race is indeed human nature; therefore, ethnoculturalism must be distinguished from racism. Ethnoculturalism is a spirit based on the identity of a race, and all humans are born according to the identity of certain races. To help understand the position of multiculturalism and ethnoculturalis, we need to undestand between The extreme left and extreme right lines above explain the position of multiculturalism on the extreme left and ethnoculturalism on the extreme right, where patriotism is in the middle (Cordeiro, 2022; Crespo, 2019; Wolin, 1992).

An understanding of the concepts of host state and settler state is essential to understanding the following discussion. For the host state model and the settler state model, the ethos dimension is very different. The patriotism dimension of a host model country is greatly influenced by the idea of ethnoculturalism, which is rooted in the nation or race of origin of the country in question. For the settler model country, its ethos dimension is more influenced by the universal dimension contained in the idea of multiculturalism.

The ideas encompassed in the understanding of multiculturalism include equality, freedom, and social justice without discrimination, some of which have been previously touched on. While Habermas' cosmopolitanism supports multiculturalism, ethnoculturalism is influenced by Schmitt's nationalism. When multiculturalism becomes radical, then anarchism exists, while when ethnoculturalism becomes radical, then it becomes racist.

Meanwhile, Multicultural patriotism represents a nuanced interpretation of national allegiance that intertwines concepts of identity, inclusion, and social cohesion across diverse cultural backgrounds. Viewed from political, cultural, sociological, and anthropological perspectives, this concept goes beyond mere

national pride to recognize and celebrate the multiplicity of identities that citizens possess in a globalized world (Eammonn Callan, 2002; Lee & Misco, 2014; Y. Li, 2021; Modood, 2020).

From a political standpoint, multicultural patriotism emerges within frameworks of citizenship and belongin as new form of nationalism (Modood, 2020). It challenges traditional nationalism, which often prioritizes singular, dominant cultural narratives. Scholars argue that citizenship can be understood as encompassing not only legal rights but also the recognition of diverse cultural identities that contribute to national identity. Culturally, multicultural patriotism recognizes the value of diversity as an integral part of national identity.

It allows for a mosaic-like representation of society, where different cultural backgrounds contribute to a composite national identity (Banks, 2020; Fatimah, 2023; Sismanto, 2021). This perspective is particularly salient in educational settings, where multicultural education serves not only to teach about diversity but also to promote a sense of collective national identity that respects all cultures. By fostering understanding and respect among diverse populations, multicultural patriotism helps mitigate potential conflicts arising from cultural differences and promotes social cohesion (Fatimah, 2023).

4. Take the Middle Path

Between multiculturalism as a extreme left phenomenon and ethnoculturalism as an extreme right phenomenon that Steven B. Smith once discussed in his work, *Reclaiming Patriotism in an Age of Extremes* (2021) (Malenkov, 2022; S. B. Smith, 2021). Between two extremes, choosing the best is not an option, but choosing to remain moderate also requires a strategy. Based on the results of our study, there are several ways to maintain a moderate stance in the context of patriotism. However, the first thing we need to do is free ourselves from the shackles of cynicism, as it will distance us from a moderate attitude (Hiel et al., 2022).

First to take the middle path or be moderate in patriotism context, To have a moderate attitude requires integrity and responsibility, Smith once discussed the concepts of conscience (the voice of inner truth) and prudence (acting on the basis of care after thinking carefully). Smith showed his lack of sympathy for the Roman proverb that said let the world perish as long as justice can be upheld. Although it is true that the issue of sincere intentions based on conscience is important, Smith raised several important questions (Smith, 2021).

First, opposition based solely on conscience is very dangerous because it is on a slippery slope. How can opposition to government abuse be confirmed to be not influenced by various individual or group interests? Many resistance movements use the concepts of justice, equality and freedom for the purpose of gaining power and other benefits. Secondly, even if abuse is true, how can it be ensured that there is no abuse in the group that opposes abuse.

Abuse in understanding patriotism in the opposing group is a major factor that makes actions based solely on conscience unable to demonstrate a person's patriotism (Elazar, 2021; Khalil, 2023; Malenkov, 2022; Smith, 2021; Smith, 2006). In this context, Smith presents an example of civil disobedience advocated by Henry Thoreau among other things, he mentioned that internal integrity is very important in showing whether or not a person is loyal, not just through voting or paying taxes (Clares, 2022; Rocha, 2019; Gallagher, 2018; Zain & Yusoff, 2017).

Thoreau organized a movement to protest the government in the United States at that time that expanded its colonies to take over lands in Mexico. According to him, the action lacked integrity, therefore citizens did not have to

pay taxes so that military efforts to expand the territories could not be carried out (Zain & Yusoff, 2017). This is what is meant by having integrity but not equipped with a sense of responsibility that Smith wanted to present to make a person patriotic. Smith posed a rhetorical question that, among other things, read, "In order to defend integrity, can a person leak the secret of military irregularities that maintain the national defense system?" In short, the question of responsibility is as important as the question of integrity and a patriotic person who opposes his government is considered legitimate if he has both components.

Smith also took examples of debates presented by Max Weber to show how a balance can be created to ensure that genuine patriotism can be ignited. In short, Weber mentioned political ethics based on the ethics of absolute goals and the ethics of practical judgment. These concepts generally explain that of course the goals of state life are to ensure justice, equality and freedom, but how all of these are to be realized requires practical discretion, appropriate to the place and circumstances, depending on each case (Farris, 2022; Leoussi, 2013; Little, 1995; Outhwaite, 2019).

Secondly, to moderate requires an approach that reconciles diverse ideological perspectives while promoting social cohesion based Ethos, pathos, and logos. The first step in moderating between these two polar opposites is establishing credibility and fostering trust within diverse communities. Multicultural education, as articulated by Astashova, emphasizes the necessity for educational systems to respect and incorporate diverse cultural backgrounds. This educational ethos champions dialogue among cultures, which can moderate extreme positions by enhancing mutual understanding and respect (Astashova et al., 2019).

Moreover, report instances where cultural practices within communities, such as the Bugis, embody respect for differing political viewpoints, thereby reinforcing community ties and social stability through credible interpersonal relationships (Zubair et al., 2022). Together, these references suggest that educational interventions can build a groundwork of credibility necessary for dialogue and conflict resolution. Pathos is Engagement of emotions plays a crucial role in connecting individuals across cultural divides.

Fostering a sense of national identity while affirming ethnic identity can evoke a shared emotional experience, essential for bridging multicultural and ethnocultural perspectives. By promoting narratives that resonate emotionally, initiatives aimed at reconciling differing cultural ideologies can cultivate empathy and reduce tensions (Olivares-Orellana et al., 2017; Soto, 2019). Such emotional connections are vital in addressing the fears and misconceptions that often underlie ethnocultural conflicts.

Logos is Logical arguments are essential to constructing a balanced discourse that considers both multiculturalism and ethnoculturalism. This requires a nuanced understanding of the sociopolitical landscapes from which these ideologies emerge. By utilizing well-reasoned arguments that respect the needs and aspirations of both multicultural and ethnocultural perspectives, it is possible to create a rational framework for governance that allows for coexistence rather than competition.

Moreover, the establishment of common grounds, as indicated by the validation of the Revised Multicultural Ideology Scale, proposes an evidence-based approach to facilitate measurable understanding of intercultural relations. This logical groundwork supports policies that balance ethnic identities while promoting social equality and diversity, thus lending credibility to moderation efforts.

CONCLUSION

To find the middle point (golden mean) between multiculturalism and ethnoculturalism, you must face narrow patriotism sentiments because they will only attract specific groups of citizens to the extreme right. Patriotic sentiments based on cosmopolitan principles of justice, equality, and freedom will attract specific groups of citizens to the extreme left. This situation causes the number of citizens in the middle to decrease if their power is concentrated in the right and left corners. We do not deny that this extreme situation is part of political life. However, it also cannot force any group to be in the middle. However, we need to emphasise that no one can deny the importance of finding the middle ground in question. In finding the middle point of patriotism, he proposed a combination of superior patriotic characteristics, including integrity and responsibility, conscience and prudence, and absolute goals and practical wisdom. This study suggests that a balanced patriotism, need to integrating civic values with cultural recognition, may better serve pluralistic societies.

REFERENCES

- Akkerman, A., Zaslove, A., & Spruyt, B. (2017). 'We the People' or 'We the Peoples'? A Comparison of Support for the Populist Radical Right and Populist Radical Left in the Netherlands. *Swiss Political Science Review*, 23(4). <https://doi.org/10.1111/spsr.12275>
- Al-Jayyousi, O., Tok, E., Saniff, S. M., Wan Hasan, W. N., Janahi, N. A., & Yesuf, A. J. (2022). Re-Thinking Sustainable Development within Islamic Worldviews: A Systematic Literature Review. *Sustainability (Switzerland)*, 14(12). <https://doi.org/10.3390/su14127300>
- Albertazzi, D., & Bonansinga, D. (2024). Beyond anger: the populist radical right on TikTok. *Journal of Contemporary European Studies*, 32(3). <https://doi.org/10.1080/14782804.2022.2163380>
- Aldrich, R., & Rudman, D. L. (2016). Situational Analysis: A Visual Analytic Approach that Unpacks the Complexity of Occupation. *Journal of Occupational Science*, 23(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/14427591.2015.1045014>
- Aly, H. (2022). Digital transformation, development and productivity in developing countries: is artificial intelligence a curse or a blessing? *Review of Economics and Political Science*, 7(4). <https://doi.org/10.1108/REPS-11-2019-0145>
- Anita, Darwis, & Baharuddin, A. (2021). Kerjasama Indonesia-Malaysia dalam Peningkatan Taraf Pendidikan Anak TKI di Negeri Sabah. In *Hasanuddin Journal of International Affairs* (Vol. 1, Issue 2).
- Arhin, K., Stockemer, D., & Normandin, M. S. (2023). THE REPUBLICAN TRUMP VOTER: A Populist Radical Right Voter Like Any Other? *World Affairs*, 186(3). <https://doi.org/10.1177/00438200231176818>
- Astashova, N. A., Bondyрева, S. K., & Zhuk, O. L. (2019). Preparation of future teachers for the implementation of the ideas of multicultural education in the interactive educational space. *Obrazovanie i Nauka*, 21(2). <https://doi.org/10.17853/1994-5639-2019-2-27-50>
- Banks, J. A. (2020). Researching Race, Culture, and Difference. In *Cultural Diversity and Education*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315622255-18>
- Barysenka, V. (2022). The Presentation of the Tatars and the Turks in the Legends Related to Miraculous Images/Icons of Our Lady in the 17-18th Centuries in the Eastern Territories of the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth. *Eikon Imago*, 11. <https://doi.org/10.5209/eiko.77629>

- Borolla¹, F. V., & Marini, A. (2022). Literature Review: The Role of Character Education in the Midst of Socio-Cultural Changes in the Digitalization Era. *Indonesian Journal of Elementary Teachers Education*, 3(2). <https://doi.org/10.25134/ijete.v3i2.7014>
- Bracic, A., Israel-Trummel, M., & Shortle, A. F. (2023). Ethnocultural or generalized? Nationalism and support for punitive immigration policy. *Politics, Groups, and Identities*, 11(5). <https://doi.org/10.1080/21565503.2022.2065320>
- Brata, N. T. (2018). *Social Mobility and Cultural Reproduction of Javanese Descendant Community in Bangkok, Thailand*. <https://doi.org/10.2991/amca-18.2018.167>
- Brönnimann, A. (2022). How to phrase critical realist interview questions in applied social science research. *Journal of Critical Realism*, 21(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/14767430.2021.1966719>
- Caiani, M., & Kröll, P. (2017). Nationalism and populism in radical right discourses in Italy and Germany. *Javnost*, 24(4). <https://doi.org/10.1080/13183222.2017.1330084>
- Callan, Eamonn. (2002). Democratic patriotism and multicultural education. *Studies in Philosophy and Education*, 21(6). <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1020861611479>
- Callan, Eamonn. (2006). Love, Idolatry, and Patriotism. *Social Theory and Practice*, 32(4). <https://doi.org/10.5840/soctheorpract200632430>
- Cavallar, G. (2012). Cosmopolitanisms in Kant's philosophy. *Ethics and Global Politics*, 5(2). <https://doi.org/10.3402/egp.v5i2.14924>
- Chaplin, J. (2023). Can Commonwealth values be grounded in religion? Resources from the Christian tradition. *Round Table*, 112(5). <https://doi.org/10.1080/00358533.2023.2268930>
- Clandini, & Conelly, M. (2000). Review of the book: Narrative Inquiry: Experience and Story in Qualitative Research. *Anthropology and Education Quarterly*, 31(3).
- Clares, D. (2022). Henry Thoreau: Voluntary Poverty as Critical Practice in Walden. *Topicos (Mexico)*, 63. <https://doi.org/10.21555/top.v63i0.1966>
- Cordeiro, R. C. (2022). O cosmopolitismo em questão: Habermas versus Schmitt. *Princípios: Revista de Filosofia (UFRN)*, 29(60). <https://doi.org/10.21680/1983-2109.2022v29n60id27145>
- Crăciunescu, A. (2016). On Methodology and (Post)Colonialism in Tourism Promotional Language. *Almatourism - Journal of Tourism, Culture and Territorial Development*, 7(13).
- Crespo, C. E. P. (2019). Jürgen Habermas como crítico e intérprete del pensamiento jurídico-político de Carl Schmitt. *Anuario Filosófico*, 52(3). <https://doi.org/10.15581/009.52.3.005>
- Creswell, J. W., & David, J. C. (2018). *Research Design: Qualitative, Quantitative, and Mixed Methods Approaches*. SAGE Publications.
- Da Rocha, A. C. (2019). Henry David Thoreau and scientific culture. *Anglo Saxonica*, 17(1). <https://doi.org/10.5334/AS.5>
- Damayanti, F., Vivien, H., Situmorang, M., Trianung, T., Management, E., & Vivien Management, H. (2023). The problem of education in Indonesia is the independent curriculum the solution. *Scholar : Educational Scientific Journal Media*, 13(5).
- Davids, M. N. (2018). Ideology critique as decolonising pedagogy: Urban forced removals as a case study. *Educational Research for Social Change*, 7(SpecialEdition). <https://doi.org/10.17159/2221-4070/2018/v7i0a2>

- Dayioğlu, A. G. (2022). Hungarian Nationalism and Hungarian Pan-Turanism until the Beginning of the Second World War. *Politics in Central Europe*, 18(2). <https://doi.org/10.2478/pce-2022-0010>
- Dikici, E. (2022). Nationalism is dead, long live nationalism! In pursuit of pluralistic nationalism: A critical overview. In *Ethnicities* (Vol. 22, Issue 1). <https://doi.org/10.1177/14687968211063694>
- Doomen, J. (2012). Human Dignity. By George Kateb. *International Philosophical Quarterly*, 52(2). <https://doi.org/10.5840/ipq201252222>
- Elazar, Y. (2021). Adam Smith on impartial patriotism. *Review of Politics*, 83(3). <https://doi.org/10.1017/S0034670521000139>
- Farris, S. R. (2022). Weber: Religion, nation and empire. *Journal of Classical Sociology*, 22(4). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1468795X221107226>
- Fatimah, S. (2023). Multicultural Society Development Dimensions of Diversity and Cultural Change. *International Journal of Islamic Social Studies*, 1(2). <https://doi.org/10.62039/ijiss.v1i2.23>
- Fendy, F., Surya, J., Angela, S., Suyati, & Lie, N. (2023). MEMAHAMI KONSEP MEDITASI DALAM KAJIAN SUTTA-SUTTA DALAM SUTTAPIṬAKA. *PATISAMBHIDA: Jurnal Pemikiran Buddha Dan Filsafat Agama*, 4(2). <https://doi.org/10.53565/patisambhida.v4i2.1040>
- Finell, E., & Zogmaister, C. (2015). Blind and constructive patriotism, national symbols and outgroup attitudes. *Scandinavian Journal of Psychology*, 56(2). <https://doi.org/10.1111/sjop.12193>
- Fischer, P., Greitemeyer, T., & Kastenmüller, A. (2007). What do we think about Muslims? The validity of Westerners' implicit theories about the associations between Muslims' religiosity, religious identity, aggression potential, and attitudes toward terrorism. *Group Processes and Intergroup Relations*, 10(3). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1368430207078697>
- Gallagher, M. (2018). Henry David Thoreau: A Life . *The New England Quarterly*, 91(4). https://doi.org/10.1162/tneq_r_00713
- Glass, J. M. (1994). The Inner Ocean: Individualism and Democratic Culture. George Kateb . *Ethics*, 105(1). <https://doi.org/10.1086/293687>
- Golding, D. (2017). Border cosmopolitanism in critical peace education. *Journal of Peace Education*, 14(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/17400201.2017.1323727>
- Green, S. (2000). Beyond ethnoculturalism? German citizenship in the new millennium. *German Politics*, 9(3). <https://doi.org/10.1080/09644000008404609>
- Grünzweig, W. (2021). The Great Psalm of the Republic: Walt Whitman's Democratic Poetics. In *Handbook of American Romanticism*. <https://doi.org/10.1515/9783110592238-024>
- Gutierrez Rodriguez, E., Boatcă, M., & Costa, S. (2016). Decolonizing European Sociology. In *Decolonizing European Sociology*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9781315576190>
- Hajir, B., & Kester, K. (2020). Toward a Decolonial Praxis in Critical Peace Education: Postcolonial Insights and Pedagogic Possibilities. *Studies in Philosophy and Education*, 39(5). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11217-020-09707-y>
- Halikiopoulou, D., Mock, S., & Vasilopoulou, S. (2013). The civic zeitgeist: Nationalism and liberal values in the European radical right. *Nations and Nationalism*, 19(1). <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8129.2012.00550.x>
- Harteveld, E., Van Der Brug, W., De Lange, S., & Van Der Meer, T. (2022). Multiple roots of the populist radical right: Support for the Dutch PVV in cities and the countryside. *European Journal of Political Research*, 61(2).

- <https://doi.org/10.1111/1475-6765.12452>
- Herrero, M. (2003). Legitimidad política y participación. *Anuario Filosófico*, 36(1–2). <https://doi.org/10.15581/009.36.29414>
- Hossain, M. R., Akhter, F., & Sultana, M. M. (2022). SMEs in Covid-19 Crisis and Combating Strategies: A Systematic Literature Review (SLR) and A Case from Emerging Economy. *Operations Research Perspectives*, 9. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.orp.2022.100222>
- Huang, Z., Yang, Z., & Meng, T. (2023). National Identity of Locality: The State, Patriotism, and Nationalism in Cyber China. *Journal of Chinese Political Science*, 28(1). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11366-022-09820-4>
- Huber, J. (2017). Cosmopolitanism for earth dwellers: Kant on the right to be somewhere. *Kantian Review*, 22(1). <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1369415416000340>
- Iceland, J., Silver, E., & Goff, K. (2023). For whom is patriotism blind? Examining the roles of moral intuitions and system justification. *Social Science Research*, 112. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ssresearch.2022.102811>
- Kaiser, V. (2012). George Kateb, Dignidad Humana. *Revista de Ciencia Política (Santiago)*, 32(1). <https://doi.org/10.4067/s0718-090x2012000100016>
- Khalil, E. L. (2023). Two Anomalies Facing the Patriotism-Cosmopolitanism Continuum Thesis: Reading Adam Smith. *International Philosophical Quarterly*, 63(2). <https://doi.org/10.5840/ipq202414225>
- Khushk, A., Zengtian, Z., & Hui, Y. (2023). Role of female leadership in corporate innovation: a systematic literature review. In *Gender in Management* (Vol. 38, Issue 3). <https://doi.org/10.1108/GM-01-2022-0028>
- Kilkey, M. (2010). Men and domestic labor: A missing link in the global care chain. *Men and Masculinities*, 13(1). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1097184X10382884>
- Kim, B. (2020). Carl Schmitt. Political Theology: Four Chapters on the Concept of Sovereignty. *Theological Research Institute of Sahmyook University*, 22(1). <https://doi.org/10.56035/tod.2020.22.1.163>
- Kitromilides, P. M. (2018). The modernity of nations. A tribute to Walker Connor. *Nations and Nationalism*, 24(3). <https://doi.org/10.1111/nana.12442>
- Kleingeld, P. (2016). Kant's moral and political cosmopolitanism. In *Philosophy Compass* (Vol. 11, Issue 1). <https://doi.org/10.1111/phc3.12298>
- Kraus, S., Breier, M., & Dasí-Rodríguez, S. (2020). The art of crafting a systematic literature review in entrepreneurship research. *International Entrepreneurship and Management Journal*, 16(3). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11365-020-00635-4>
- Kulkarni, A., & Mishra, M. (2022). Aspects of Women's Leadership in the Organisation: Systematic Literature Review. *South Asian Journal of Human Resources Management*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.1177/23220937211056139>
- Lash, C. L. (2017). Defining "American" in the context of immigration: a case study of Helping Hands Elementary. *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 40(6). <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2016.1250933>
- Lee, L., & Misco, T. (2014). All for One or One for All: An Analysis of the Concepts of Patriotism and Others in Multicultural Korea Through Elementary Moral Education Textbooks. *Asia-Pacific Education Researcher*, 23(3). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s40299-013-0146-1>
- Leidig, E., Ganesh, B., & Bright, J. (2022). New forms of cultural nationalism? American and British Indians in the Trump and Brexit Twittersphere. *Nations and Nationalism*, 28(1). <https://doi.org/10.1111/nana.12781>
- Leoussi, A. S. (2013). Max Weber in the thought of Edward Shils (1910-1995) and

- Ernest Gellner (1925-1995): The paradox of two Weberian approaches to the understanding of nations and nationalism? *Ethnic and Racial Studies*, 36(12). <https://doi.org/10.1080/01419870.2012.681674>
- Lestari, P., & Sihombing, L. H. (2022). The Portrait of Nationalism in The Superman Is Dead's Song, Jadilah Legenda. *Virtuoso: Jurnal Pengkajian Dan Penciptaan Musik*, 5(1). <https://doi.org/10.26740/vt.v5n1.p57-64>
- Li, J., Liu, L., & Qing, Q. (2022). Differentiated consumer forgiveness for different corporate social irresponsibility domains: The moderating role of corporate reputation and patriotism. *Journal of Retailing and Consumer Services*, 69. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jretconser.2022.103122>
- Li, Y. (2021). The Patriotism Education in History Courses of Israeli Middle School. *Asian Journal of Middle Eastern and Islamic Studies*, 15(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/25765949.2021.1928414>
- Lin, J. C., & Jackson, L. (2023). Patriotism in moral education: Toward a rational approach in China. *Journal of Moral Education*, 52(3). <https://doi.org/10.1080/03057240.2022.2136148>
- Lin, M., Chai, C. S., & Liang, J. C. (2022). A mediation model of the relationship between university students' news media literacy and xenophobia: The role of intellectual humility, perceived threat, and blind patriotism. *Frontiers in Psychology*, 13. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpsyg.2022.1036497>
- Little, D. (1995). Belief, Ethnicity, and Nationalism. *Nationalism and Ethnic Politics*, 1(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/13537119508428433>
- Lundström, M., & Poletti Lundström, T. (2023). Radical nationalism. *Journal of Political Ideologies*. <https://doi.org/10.1080/13569317.2023.2241384>
- Mader, M. (2016). Stabilität und Wandel der nationalen Identität in der deutschen Bevölkerung. *Kolner Zeitschrift Fur Soziologie Und Sozialpsychologie*, 68(3). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11577-016-0370-9>
- Malenkov, V. V. (2022). The image of patriotism and civil-patriotic orientations of youth. *Izvestiya of Saratov University. Sociology. Politology*, 22(1). <https://doi.org/10.18500/1818-9601-2022-22-1-60-65>
- Mallon, F. E. (2023). Peasant and Nation: The Making of Postcolonial Mexico and Peru. In *Peasant and Nation: The Making of Postcolonial Mexico and Peru*. <https://doi.org/10.2307/2517881>
- Marinthe, G., Testé, B., & Kamiejski, R. (2023). Don't burn our flag: patriotism, perceived threat, and the impact of desecrating a national symbol on intergroup attitudes. *Current Psychology*, 42(5). <https://doi.org/10.1007/s12144-021-01696-6>
- Marwah, I. S. (2022). White Progress: Kant, Race and Teleology. *Kantian Review*, 27(4). <https://doi.org/10.1017/S1369415422000334>
- McCorkle, W., & Rodriguez, S. (2023). Levels of nationalism among middle and high school social studies teachers: Implications for promoting equity for immigrant students and with educators. *Journal of Social Studies Research*, 47(2). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jssr.2022.01.004>
- Mitchell, A. (2018). A review of mixed methods, pragmatism and abduction techniques. *Electronic Journal of Business Research Methods*, 16(3).
- Modood, T. (2020). Multiculturalism as a New Form of Nationalism? *Nations and Nationalism*, 26(2). <https://doi.org/10.1111/nana.12571>
- Modzelewski, H. (2014). Autorreflexión y educación de las emociones para la democracia. Entrevista a Martha Nussbaum. In *Arete* (Vol. 26, Issue 2). <https://doi.org/10.18800/arete.201402.007>
- Murphy, M. (2019). A Post-Western Account of Critical Cosmopolitan Social Theory. *Glocalism*, 3. <https://doi.org/10.12893/gjcpi.2019.3.4>

- N.N. Lopes Salles, D. M., Da Silva Lima Ribeiro, V., & Cunha Cancio, V. R. (2023). Dignidade humana como ponte entre capacidades e direitos em Martha Nussbaum. *Revista Interdisciplinar de Direitos Humanos*, 11(1). <https://doi.org/10.5016/ridh.v11i1.229>
- Olivares-Orellana, E., Alleksaht-Snider, M., Vazquez Dominguez, M., Buxton, C., Karsli, E., Lam, V. L., Chaudry, F. R., Pinder, M., Sura, T., Kumi-Yeboah, A., Brobbey, G., Smith, P., Aguiar, C., Silva, C. S., Guerra, R., Rodrigues, R. B., Ribeiro, L. A., Pastori, G., Leseman, P., ... Vathi, Z. (2017). Exploring the Training and Experiences of School-Based Mental Health Professionals Who Work with Latino Immigrant Youth. *Migration Policy Institute*, 18(1).
- Outhwaite, W. (2019). Max Weber's conception of 'rationalization' and the 21st century. *Russian Sociological Review*, 18(2). <https://doi.org/10.17323/1728-192x-2019-2-16-27>
- Overcash, J. A. (2003). Narrative research: A review of methodology and relevance to clinical practice. *Critical Reviews in Oncology/Hematology*, 48(2). <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.critrevonc.2003.04.006>
- P, M., & A, K. (2023). Preparation and Standardization of Siddha Herbal Formulation Bhavana Panchankula Thailam. *International Journal of Research and Review*, 10(8). <https://doi.org/10.52403/ijrr.20230894>
- Pabubung, M. R. (2023). An Inquiry Into Human Dignity According to George Kateb. *Jurnal Filsafat*, 33(2). <https://doi.org/10.22146/jf.65585>
- Pekkanen, T. L., & Penttilä, V. (2021). The responsibility of an ethnocentric consumer – nationalistic, patriotic or environmentally conscientious? A critical discourse analysis of "buy domestic" campaigns. *International Marketing Review*, 38(2). <https://doi.org/10.1108/IMR-06-2019-0163>
- Pietkiewicz, R. (2021). Reception of Christian Hebraism in the Polish-Lithuanian Commonwealth during the Renaissance. *Rocznik Teologiczny*, 1. <https://doi.org/10.36124/rt.2021.04>
- Prakosa, P. (2022). Moderasi Beragama: Praksis Kerukunan Antar Umat Beragama. *Jurnal Ilmiah Religiosity Entity Humanity (JIREH)*, 4(1). <https://doi.org/10.37364/jireh.v4i1.69>
- Ridwan, M., Ulum, B., Muhammad, F., Indragiri, I., & Sulthan Thaha Saifuddin Jambi, U. (2021). Pentingnya Penerapan Literature Review pada Penelitian Ilmiah (The Importance Of Application Of Literature Review In Scientific Research). *Jurnal Masohi*, 2(1).
- Robeyns, I. (2005). The Capability Approach: a theoretical survey. *Journal of Human Development*, 6(1). <https://doi.org/10.1080/146498805200034266>
- Rodi, P., Karavasilis, L., & Puleo, L. (2023). When nationalism meets populism: examining right-wing populist & nationalist discourses in the 2014 & 2019 European parliamentary elections. *European Politics and Society*, 24(2). <https://doi.org/10.1080/23745118.2021.1994809>
- Rupar, M., Sekerdej, M., & Jamróz-Dolińska, K. (2021). The role of national identification in explaining political and social civic engagement. *Group Processes and Intergroup Relations*, 24(8). <https://doi.org/10.1177/1368430220967975>
- Samsu, K. H. K. (2022). Understanding the Dimensions of Patriotism: A Literature Highlight. *International Journal of Academic Research in Business and Social Sciences*, 12(12). <https://doi.org/10.6007/ijarbss/v12-i12/16004>
- Schildkraut, D. J. (2003). American identity and attitudes toward official-English policies. *Political Psychology*, 24(3). <https://doi.org/10.1111/0162-895X.00337>

- Schlote, C. (2022). Indian Servitude(s) in Imperial London: Tanika Gupta's *The Empress*. *Journal of Contemporary Drama in English*, 10(2). <https://doi.org/10.1515/jcde-2022-0023>
- Sekerdej, M., & Roccas, S. (2016). Love versus loving criticism: Disentangling conventional and constructive patriotism. *The British Journal of Social Psychology*, 55(3). <https://doi.org/10.1111/bjso.12142>
- Shona, M. (2023). How to Write a Literature Review | Guide, Examples, & Templates. *Scribbr*, 1(1).
- Sismanto. (2021). Kajian Fenomenologis Dimensi Budaya dan Agama Masyarakat Multikultural Sangatta Kutai Timur. *Prosiding Mukhtar Pemikiran Dosen Pmii*, 1(1 SE-Islamic Studies).
- Slavoj Zizek. (1999). The Challenge of Carl Schmitt. In *Phronesis*.
- Smith, S. B. (2021). Reclaiming patriotism in an age of extremes. In *Reclaiming Patriotism in an Age of Extremes*. <https://doi.org/10.12987/9780300258707>
- Smith, T. W. (2006). National Pride in Comparative Perspective: 1995/96 and 2003/04. *International Journal of Public Opinion Research*, 18(1). <https://doi.org/10.1093/ijpor/edk007>
- Smylie, J., Martin, C. M., Kaplan-Myrth, N., Steele, L., Tait, C., & Hogg, W. (2004). Knowledge translation and indigenous knowledge. *International Journal of Circumpolar Health*, 63 Suppl 2. <https://doi.org/10.3402/ijch.v63i0.17877>
- Snyder, H. (2019). Literature review as a research methodology: An overview and guidelines. *Journal of Business Research*, 104. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jbusres.2019.07.039>
- Soto, C. (2019). Critical pedagogy in Hong Kong: Classroom stories of struggle and hope. In *Critical Pedagogy in Hong Kong: Classroom Stories of Struggle and Hope*. <https://doi.org/10.4324/9780429465215>
- Städtler, M. (2019). 'A whole of all men.' World citizenship and ethical internationalism in Kant. In *Con-textos Kantianos* (Issue 10). <https://doi.org/10.5281/zenodo.3583134>
- Subaryana, S. (2022). Menata Ulang Patriotisme dan Nasionalisme Indonesia. *MUKADIMAH: Jurnal Pendidikan, Sejarah, Dan Ilmu-Ilmu Sosial*, 6(2). <https://doi.org/10.30743/mkd.v6i2.5823>
- Swanson, T. D. (2023). Thea Riofrancos, Resource Radicals: From Petro-Nationalism to Post-Extractivism in Ecuador. *Journal for the Study of Religion, Nature and Culture*. <https://doi.org/10.1558/jsrnc.20631>
- Syarifah, M., Indriyani, D., & Almachim, A. C. (2023). Nationalism Education: Dialectical Relations Between Darussalam Islamic Boarding School Education and Tradition of the Manokwari Society of West Papua. *IJIBS*, 1(2). <https://doi.org/10.35719/ijibs.v1i2.28>
- Szymborski, G. (2020). The duchy of courland and semigallia between the polish-lithuanian commonwealth and the russian empire. The diplomatic dispute on charles christian wetten's reign 1759–1763. Analysis of the selected aspects. *Journal of the Institute of Latvian History*, 112(2). <https://doi.org/10.22364/LVIZ.112.02>
- Tsigdinos, S., Tzouras, P. G., Bakogiannis, E., Kepaptsoglou, K., & Nikitas, A. (2022). The future urban road: A systematic literature review-enhanced Q-method study with experts. *Transportation Research Part D: Transport and Environment*, 102. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.trd.2021.103158>
- Udofia, C. A. (2023). Henry David Thoreau and the Philosophy of Civil Disobedience as a Non-Catalytic Cum Catalytic Model for Conflict Resolution. *Stallion Journal for Multidisciplinary Associated Research*

- Studies*, 2(3). <https://doi.org/10.55544/sjmars.2.3.1>
- Uimonen, P. (2020). Decolonising cosmopolitanism: An anthropological reading of Immanuel Kant and Kwame Nkrumah on the world as one. *Critique of Anthropology*, 40(1). <https://doi.org/10.1177/0308275X19840412>
- Van Hiel, A., Van Assche, J., Haesevoets, T., De Cremer, D., & Hodson, G. (2022). A Radical Vision of Radicalism: Political Cynicism, not Incrementally Stronger Partisan Positions, Explains Political Radicalization. *Political Psychology*, 43(S1). <https://doi.org/10.1111/pops.12785>
- Veevere, V. (2021). Martha Nussbaum: Humanism, Terapy of Emotions and Religious Tolerance. *Religiski-Filozofiski Raksti*, 29.
- Višić, M. (2022). CONNECTING PUZZLE PIECES: SYSTEMATIC LITERATURE REVIEW METHOD IN THE SOCIAL SCIENCES. *Sociologija*, 64(4). <https://doi.org/10.2298/SOC2204543V>
- Vucic, B. (2023). Our Home: a revolutionary case study in social pedagogy. *International Journal of Social Pedagogy*, 12(1). <https://doi.org/10.14324/111.444.ijsp.2023.v12.x.012>
- Ward, L. (2022). Political Theology and Constitutionalism in Carl Schmitt and Jürgen Habermas. In *Political Theology* (Vol. 23, Issue 3). <https://doi.org/10.1080/1462317X.2022.2071792>
- Wimmer, A. (2019). Why nationalism works: And why it isn't going away. *Foreign Affairs*, 98(27).
- Wolin, R. (1992). Carl Schmitt: The Conservative Revolutionary Habitus and the Aesthetics of Horror. *Political Theory*, 20(3). <https://doi.org/10.1177/0090591792020003003>
- Wu, J. (2022). Cosmopolitanism, Comparison and Affect: Decolonising Isabella Bird's The Yangtze Valley and Beyond (1899). *English Studies*, 103(6). <https://doi.org/10.1080/0013838X.2022.2090112>
- Yuca, V., Suherman, U., & Budiamin, A. (2023). Differences of adolescent career maturity in indonesia: a gender and job aspirations based approach. *Jurnal EDUCATIO: Jurnal Pendidikan Indonesia*, 9(1). <https://doi.org/10.29210/1202322355>
- Zain, Z. M., & Yusoff, M. A. (2017). Civil Disobedience: Concept and Practice. *Asian Social Science*, 13(8). <https://doi.org/10.5539/ass.v13n8p129>
- Zhuravlev, O., & Ishchenko, V. (2020). Exclusiveness of civic nationalism: Euromaidan eventful nationalism in Ukraine. *Post-Soviet Affairs*, 36(3). <https://doi.org/10.1080/1060586X.2020.1753460>
- Zubair, A., Hamzah, H., & Satriadi, S. (2022). Living Religious Moderation within the Sipakatau, Sipakainge', and Sipakalebbi Cultures of the Bugis Community. *Walisongo: Jurnal Penelitian Sosial Keagamaan*, 30(2). <https://doi.org/10.21580/ws.30.2.13048>